

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

**IN RE: VALSARTAN PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION**

**CIVIL ACTION NUMBER:
19-md-02875-RBK-KMW**

**ORDERS TO SHOW CAUSE
VIA TELECONFERENCE**

Mitchell H. Cohen Building & U.S. Courthouse
4th & Cooper Streets
Camden, New Jersey 08101
May 3, 2021
Commencing at 12:15 p.m.

B E F O R E:

**THE HONORABLE ROBERT B. KUGLER,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
SPECIAL MASTER THE HONORABLE
THOMAS I. VANASKIE**

A P P E A R A N C E S:

MAZIE SLATER KATZ & FREEMAN, LLC
BY: ADAM M. SLATER, ESQUIRE
103 Eisenhower Parkway
Roseland, New Jersey 07068
For the Plaintiffs

KIRTLAND & PACKARD, LLP
BY: BEHRAM V. PAREKH, ESQUIRE
1638 South Pacific Coast Highway
Redondo Beach, California 90277
For the Plaintiffs

GOLDENBERG LAW, LLC
BY: MARLENE J. GOLDENBERG, ESQUIRE
800 Lasalle Avenue, Suite 2150
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
For the Plaintiffs

Camille Pedano, Official Court Reporter
camillepedano@gmail.com
609-774-1494

Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography; transcript
produced by computer-aided transcription.

A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued) :

KANNER & WHITELEY, LLC
BY: DAVID J. STANOCH, ESQUIRE
701 Camp Street
New Orleans, Louisiana 70130
For the Plaintiffs

DUANE MORRIS, LLP
BY: SETH A. GOLDBERG, ESQUIRE
JESSICA PRISELAC, ESQUIRE
KELLY BONNER, ESQUIRE
30 South 17th Street
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
For the Defendants, Princeton Pharmaceuticals,
Solco Healthcare U.S. LLC, and
Zhejiang Huahai Pharmaceuticals Ltd.

GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP
BY: VICTORIA DAVIS LOCKARD, ESQUIRE
LORI G. COHEN, ESQUIRE
STEVEN M. HARKINS, ESQUIRE
3333 Piedmont Road, NE, Suite 2500
Atlanta, Georgia 30305
For the Defendants, Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.,
Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Actavis LLC,
and Actavis Pharma, Inc.

CIPRIANI & WERNER, P.C.
BY: JESSICA M. HEINZ, ESQUIRE
JILL FERTEL, ESQUIRE
450 Sentry Parkway
Blue Bell, Pennsylvania 19422
And

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
BY: JOHN P. LAVELLE, JR.
1701 Market Street
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
For the Defendants, Aurolife Pharma LLC
and Aurobindo Pharma USA, Inc.

HILL WALLACK, LLP
BY: ERIC I. ABRAHAM, ESQUIRE
NAKUL Y. SHAH, ESQUIRE
21 Roszel Road
Princeton, New Jersey 08540
Attorney for Defendants, Hetero Drugs and Hetero Labs

A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued) :

ULMER & BERNE, LLP
BY: JEFFREY D. GEOPPINGER, ESQUIRE
600 Vine Street, Suite 2800
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
For the Wholesaler Defendants and AmerisourceBergen

BARNES & THORNBURG, LLP
BY: SARAH E. JOHNSTON, ESQUIRE
2029 Century Park East, Suite 300
Los Angeles, California 90067
For the Retailer Defendants and CVS Pharmacy, Inc., and
Rite Aid Corporation

ALSO PRESENT:

LORETTA SMITH, ESQUIRE
Judicial Law Clerk to The Honorable Robert B. Kugler

Larry MacStravic, Courtroom Deputy

1 (PROCEEDINGS held via teleconference before The Honorable
2 Robert B. Kugler, United States District Judge, at 12:15 p.m.)

3 JUDGE KUGLER: Okay. We'll start again.

4 There's one case on the order to show cause list but
5 it had been previously dismissed, that was the Williams, Naomi
6 Williams, case, so we don't need to be concerned with that.

7 There are three cases the defense seeks to move to an
8 order to show cause, Gwendolyn Mundy, M-U-N-D-Y, Arnold
9 Ragland, R-A-G-L-A-N-D, and Michael Canfara, C-A-N-F-A-R-A.
10 And, Mr. Harkins, you're still seeking an order to show cause
11 on those three?

12 MR. HARKINS: Yes, Your Honor. The defense seeks an
13 order to show cause returnable at the May CMC on those three
14 cases.

15 JUDGE KUGLER: Any objection from any plaintiffs?

16 MS. GOLDENBERG: Your Honor, this is Marlene
17 Goldenberg on behalf of the plaintiffs.

18 I understand that there are apparently a number of
19 deficiencies that exist on the second two cases but as to the
20 first one, Gwendolyn Mundy, this is just about a failure to
21 itemize medical expenses and a show-cause order and a
22 subsequent dismissal seem to be a pretty severe sanction for
23 something like that. So we would oppose that one.

24 JUDGE VANASKIE: Well, we're not at the stage of
25 dismissing them; we're just seeking an order to show cause. It

1 gives you another 30 days to try to work out whatever that
2 difficulty is. I'll hear you if you object to dismissal 30
3 days from now.

4 MS. GOLDENBERG: Understood, Your Honor.

5 JUDGE KUGLER: So we will move those three to an order
6 to show cause status returnable at the next conference.

7 And then there are, let's see, 13 cases you want to
8 relist for a second listing, correct, Mr. Harkins?

9 MR. HARKINS: Your Honor, Steve Harkins again.

10 There's one update on Case Number 9 on the list,
11 Robinette Lawler. We've resolved the issues and that case can
12 be taken off the list for the next agenda statement.

13 JUDGE KUGLER: Number 9, Lawler, L-A-W-L-E-R, that
14 will be taken off the list. Any objections from the plaintiffs
15 as to moving these other cases to another listing, the 12 other
16 cases, any objections?

17 (No response.)

18 JUDGE KUGLER: Hearing none, then we will move Daniel
19 Kopp, K-O-P-P, Karen Rex, R-E-X, Vanessa Nelson, N-E-L-S-O-N,
20 Virginia Hockenjos, H-O-C-K-E-N-J-O-S, John Wilcox,
21 W-I-L-C-O-X, Darriis Knox, K-N-O-X, Randall Harrah, H-A-R-R-A-H,
22 James Gibson, Jr., G-I-B-S-O-N, Norman Becton, B-E-C-T-O-N,
23 Julie Sundermeir, S-U-N-D-E-R-M-E-I-R, Debbie Aloian,
24 A-L-O-I-A-N, and Thomas DeClerk, D-E capital C-L-E-R-K, to
25 another listing.

1 Any other matters that need to be brought to my
2 attention about these orders to show cause or listings?

3 MR. HARKINS: None from the defense, Your Honor.

4 JUDGE KUGLER: Any other matters that you want to
5 discuss with me at this time on either side?

6 MR. GOLDBERG: Nothing from the defense, Your Honor.

7 MR. SLATER: Nothing from the plaintiffs, Your Honor,
8 per the agenda.

9 MR. GOLDBERG: And nothing from the defense, Your
10 Honor.

11 JUDGE KUGLER: All right. It seems we have completed
12 the agenda then. That was easy.

13 And thank you, everybody. Stay safe and stay well and
14 we will talk to you again in a month.

15 MR. SLATER: Thank you very much, Your Honor.

16 MR. GOLDBERG: Thank you, Your Honor.

17 (The proceedings concluded at 12:23 p.m.)

18 - - - - -

19

20 I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript
21 from the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

22

23 /S/ Camille Pedano, CCR, RMR, CRR, CRC, RPR
24 Court Reporter/Transcriber

25 05/04/2021
Date